ENDING RACIAL DISCRIMINATION IN TRAFFIC STOPS:

Feedback from Community on Traffic Stops – San Francisco Police Department Draft General Order 9.01 DRAFT REPORT SUMMARY

San Francisco Human Rights Commission
Office of Racial Equity
Community Stakeholders

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

Pretext Traffic Stops

Background

Racial disparities in traffic stops

Compared to other California jurisdictions, SFPD had the highest disparities in stops of Black and Pacific Islander people (CA RIPA 2022)

Proposed SFPD traffic stop policy (Draft General Order 9.01)

- Ban on biased stops
- Limit on pretext stops
- Limit on searches and questions
- Data collection, reporting, supervisor review

Traffic stop policy changes across the U.S.

Varying approaches taken to update traffic stop enforcement in: Seattle, Berkeley, Los Angeles, Philadelphia, Oregon, Virginia, Texas, Massachusetts, Minneapolis, Tennessee Disparity Index (Ratio of Traffic Stops to Population)

SFPD

- 5.4x Black
- 4.1x Pacific Islander

CA Average

- 2.5x Black
- **1.5x** Pacific Islander

Existing SFPD policies related to racial discrimination

- Bias-Free Policing Policy
- Community-Oriented Policing and Problem Solving
- Cal DOJ Collaborative
 Reform Initiative



Outreach and Engagement

Community

There were challenges and successes connected with efforts to hear from community stakeholders.

The Human Rights Commission recognizes many of the listening sessions had low attendance rates, but believes the diversity of stakeholders and the amount of meetings hosted help validate the process.

Additional concerns might include the appearance of bias and lack of neutrality in some of the facilitators.

19 Engagements

In person and online from August to November 2022

160+
Participants

Across all in-person workshops in neighborhoods with the most traffic stops

1,200+
Minutes

225Survey responses

Stopped in the last year:41% of Black respondents24% of Latine respondents12% of Asian respondents10% of White respondents

Community Themes:

What people saw in the draft policy

Many of the comments and sentiments expressed in the community listening sessions highlight a need to use common sense, be honest and explore shifts that can't be addressed in a policy

Many reasons for traffic stops no longer make sense

Many technical "infractions" did not have a clear safety basis, or even contradicted safety practices

Many people have been stopped for the reasons listed in the draft policy

Strong sense among participants, especially Black, Latine, and Pacific Islander, that unnecessary stops were due to racial profiling and carried high risk of harassment and violence from officers

Community themes:

Desired change Across policy, practice, And culture Ending racially motivated traffic stops and misconduct

Daily and weekly monitoring of racial disparities in traffic stops

Emotional closure through police and police accountability processes

Community leadership participation in officer discipline

Officer engagement and investment in their communities

A shift to being supportive, not punitive